

## POSUDEK OPONUJÍCÍ/HO BAKALÁŘSKÉ PRÁCE

Jméno studující/ho: Ivana Tománková

Název práce: Business Cycles and Fertility: The Impact of Unemployment on the Fertility Rate

Jméno oponent/ho práce: Petr Bartoň

	Ano	Spíše ano	Spíše ne či vůbec
<b>Hodnocení obsahu práce:</b>			
<i>Cíl práce (popište vlastními slovy):</i>			
Zjistit empirický vztah mezi nezaměstnaností a porodností ve vybraných zemích splňujících standard DIVNE, za použití očišťovacích kontrol.	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Zformuloval/a autor/ka cíl práce jasně?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Zvolil/a pro jeho dosažení vhodný přístup?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Byl zvolený postup práce náročný na zdroje/data?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Je hloubka analýzy dostatečná?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Využívá autor/ka relevantních vědeckých zdrojů?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Naplnil/a svůj cíl?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Přináší práce nějakou přidanou hodnotu?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

### *Slovní hodnocení (alespoň několik vět):*

Whilst the literature overview does its best to stick to the topic at hand and does not excessively delve into "broad swathes" of fertility questions, its influence on the empirical part remains slight, almost negligible. At best, it seems to have informed the author's choice of controls, but even when presenting the model there is merely a vague reference to the literature through a mere "[w]ith reference to the theoretical framework, I propose...". Some more frequent direct engagement with literature would not be amiss even in the "Empirical Analysis" section. Otherwise it does look a bit like crude data-mining. The "expected" directions of "influence" of the controls are, however, reasonably well justified through a "story" about economic behaviour in reference to such variable. However relatively arbitrary the choice of variables may be (and it is true that there exist sometimes even less well argued examples in officially published literature), perhaps greater shortcoming is the virtual absence of much consideration of the crucial \*structure\* of the estimated model. The crucial question of the lags is only "opened" up in a footnote full of purely subjective statements "I assume", "I presume" and such like. It is especially here where inspiration from the existing literature and direct work with it could have done a world of good and made the whole foundation less "hovering". Especially since the author does not present any alternative specification tests (relative to lags), though the data lend themselves to being tested for this. Especially since the author's primary background overview paper itself points out this as something that needs attention (in the future).

### Hodnocení formy a stylu práce:

Je práce logická a přehledná?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Je funkčně vybavena daty, tabulkami, grafy, přílohami apod.?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Pracuje autor/ka správně s odkazy a citacemi?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Odpovídá autorův/autorčin styl akademické práci?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Je abstrakt skutečným abstraktem, nikoli jen původním zadáním?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

### Slovní hodnocení (alespoň několik vět):

Though the empirical content could have been a bit deeper even at the BA level, there is little room for improvement in the realm of structure. Everything is where one would expect it, one does not get lost in the paper, and it reads well. The intro especially is of a star quality. On the style side, the author has definitely mastered the skill of writing a research paper beyond reproach.

Some graphs could have been presented in a more illustrative way. For example Figure 2 screams at the reader "there is no effect so why does the author bother", yet I am sure by choice of two different scales for the two series a better graphical justification of the author's efforts would have been achieved.

The literature list is reasonably impressive, though the reader cannot escape the suspicion that almost all (if not literally all) of it comes not from the listed sources but from the review paper by Sobotka et al. Though I cannot naturally prove it beyond reasonable doubt (the criminal court standard), only up to the standard of preponderance of evidence (the civil court standard). As students generally consider their defence as a criminal, not civil procedure (why they do so we know not), I leave the matter as a mere speculation.

---

### Další hodnocení či připomínky (v případě opakované obhajoby zde vedoucí práce také zhodnotí úspěch přepracování původní práce):

---

### Otázky k obhajobě (alespoň dvě):

Your favourite Sobotka (et al.!) overview says in its concluding section: " Future research should investigate both theoretical and conceptual issues: a precise delineation of the economic and fertility indicators used, envisioned time lags between economic recession and fertility, and contextual and policy factors that can influence the recession/fertility relationship." This forms the basis for my questions. I have dealt with the (suboptimal) delineation of indicators above, so there are two things left:

1) How would you go about testing the size of lag(s), if you did want to contribute to our understanding of how the world works? (This is an acceptable form of data-mining, in the form of "I have no theory, let the data tell me".)

2) There is very little (nay, none) consideration of (fertility) policy changes in your data and in your model. Yet we hear every day that there is such thing as fertility economic policy. What kind of data would you consider to tick this box in Sobotka's cautionary note?

Navržená známka: **v ý b o r n ě** .....

Datum: 6+6=12 .....

.....  
Podpis oponující/ho práce