Erasmus Mundus Joint Master Degree in
Economics of Globalisation and European Integration

Academic Year 2015-2016

DISSERTATION EVALUATION
READER'S FORM

Dissertation title: What is the rationale behind immigration policies? Do developed countries really want to restrict immigration?

Student's name: **Tsybyktarov Aldar**

Reader's name: Nicola Coniglio (University of Bari)

FINAL OVERALL GRADE:	2,5

Detailed appreciation:

Item	Mark (0 to 5)
Presentation	4
Is the dissertation well organised?	4
Is the list of references well organised?	4
Are the tables and figures well-presented and appropriately referenced?	4
Does the dissertation fit in the 12,000 worlds limit? (Penalise if you think the limit has not been reasonably respected.)	4
Literature review and references	3
Is there a good enough coverage of the literature that is reviewed?	3
Are the main relevant contributions included in the list of references?	3
Does the literature review clearly present the main questions and results of the literature?	3
Models and theoretical analysis	Not applicable
Is the choice of assumptions clearly motivated?	
Is the choice of assumptions relevant?	
If there are, what is the quality of the proofs?	
Econometric analysis	Not applicable
Is the choice of the econometric model a relevant one?	
Is the choice of econometric methods appropriate?	
Are the main econometric problems (e.g. endogeneity) well dealt with?	
Argumentation	2,5
Is the dissertation well motivated?	3
Is the argumentation well-presented and clear?	3
What is the quality of the interpretation of the main results?	2,5
What is the degree of originality of the work?	0,5
What is the potential of the dissertation to lead to publication in an academic journal?	0

Working on the dissertation	Not applicable
Has the student regularly worked on the dissertation all along the year?	
Was the student regularly in touch with the supervisor?	
Was the student understanding and taking account of the supervisor's remarks?	
Was the student really autonomous?	

Your general appreciation:

Comments to the revised version (*)

The revised version has clearly improved compared to the previous one. In particular the thesis is better argumented and organized and some key references have been included and correctly discussed.
Still the degree of originality and the ability to critically use economic research is limited.
The work is overall sufficient.

(*) Comments to previous version
The thesis is a survey of the literature on immigration and immigration policy. There is a focus on 3 countries (Germany, Czech Republic and USA).
I find the thesis too broad in its scope and highly superficial. Nothing is really investigated in depth. Crucial references in the literature are overlooked (for instance no reference in the immigration and labour market effects is made on authors such as Borjas, Card, Ottaviano and Peri ...etc).
Some critical discussion is made on immigration policy in the Czech Republic. Clearly the student did some effort but in my opinion the thesis's evaluation cannot be more than a pass.

Reader's signature: Nicola D. Coniglio   Date: 16/10/2016